

# **Exhibit A**

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

**IN RE: JOHNSON & JOHNSON  
TALCUM POWDER PRODUCTS  
MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES  
AND LIABILITY LITIGATIONS**

Master Docket No. 3:16-md-02738 (FLW)

Honorable Freda L. Wolfson

This document relates to:

BARBARA MIHALICH, individually and  
on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Case No.: 3:16-cv-06695 (FLW)

Plaintiff,

v.

JOHNSON & JOHNSON and JOHNSON  
& JOHNSON CONSUMER  
COMPANIES, INC.,

Defendants.

-----  
**JOINT STIPULATION AND REQUEST FOR ENTRY OF FINAL JUDGMENT;  
AND [~~PROPOSED~~] ORDER**  
-----

Timothy G. Blood  
Paula R. Brown  
BLOOD HURST & O'REARDON, LLP  
701 B Street, Suite 1700  
San Diego, CA 92101  
T: 619/338-1100  
F: 619/338-1101

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Barbara Mihalich*

Matthew D. Powers  
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP  
Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-3823  
T: 415/984-8700  
F: 415/984-8701

*Attorneys for Defendants Johnson & Johnson;  
and Johnson & Johnson Consumer Inc.*

## JOINT STIPULATION

Plaintiff Barbara Mihalich and Defendants Johnson & Johnson and Johnson & Johnson Consumer Inc. (collectively “J&J,” and together with Plaintiff, the “Parties”) jointly stipulate and request that the Court dismiss the *Mihalich* consumer class case (Case No. 3:16-cv-06695-FLW-LHG) on the same basis that the Court dismissed the *Estrada* consumer class case (ECF Nos. 50, 51, Case No. 3:16-cv-07492-FLW-LHG), as set forth below.

WHEREAS, on July 14, 2017, the Court dismissed with leave to amend the First Amended Complaint in *Estrada*, concluding that Plaintiff Mona Estrada did not allege any injury in fact and “lacks standing to bring suit.” Case No. 3:16-cv-07492-FLW-LHG, ECF Nos. 50 (Opinion), 51 (Order Granting Motion to Dismiss);

WHEREAS, on August 9, 2017, Plaintiff Estrada filed a Request for Entry of Final Judgment, stating that she did not intend to amend her complaint and requesting that the Court enter a final judgment “so that the time for Plaintiff to appeal the Court’s Order begins to run.” *Id.*, ECF No. 52;

WHEREAS, on August 10, 2017, the Court ordered that the *Estrada* case be dismissed and that the matter be closed. *Id.*, ECF No. 53;

WHEREAS, per the Court's instruction, the Parties have considered the similarities and differences (if any) between California and Illinois law on the relevant issues and have reviewed Ms. Mihalich's claims under Illinois law in light of the Court's reasoning and ruling in *Estrada*;

WHEREAS, although Plaintiffs disagree with the Court's reasoning and ruling in *Estrada*, given the substantial similarities between the facts and allegations in *Estrada* and *Mihalich* the Parties expect and agree that if the Court applies the same reasoning as it did in *Estrada* it would conclude that Ms. Mihalich likewise cannot allege any injury in fact and lacks

standing to bring suit.

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs Estrada and Mihalich reserve the right to appeal the Court's rulings dismissing their complaints for failure to allege any injury in fact;

WHEREAS, to save the resources of the Court and the Parties in re-briefing this issue in *Mihalich*, and in the interest of efficiency, the Parties jointly request that the *Mihalich* case—the only other consumer class case pending before the Court as part of *In re Johnson & Johnson Talcum Powder Products Marketing, Sales Practices and Products Liability Litigations*—be dismissed for the same reasons as set forth the Court’s opinion in *Estrada* (ECF No. 50) and that the matter be closed.

NOW, THEREFORE, the Parties hereby stipulate and request that the Court:

1. Dismiss the *Mihalich* consumer class case (Case No. 3:16-cv-06695-FLW-LHG) on the basis that Plaintiff Mihalich does not allege any injury in fact and lacks standing to bring suit; and
2. Enter final judgment in *Mihalich* and order that the matter be closed.

**IT IS SO STIPULATED.**

Dated: September 27, 2017

BLOOD HURST & O'REARDON, LLP  
Timothy G. Blood  
Paula R. Brown

By: *s/ Timothy G. Blood*

TIMOTHY G. BLOOD

701 B Street, Suite 1700  
San Diego, CA 92101  
T: 619/338-1100

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Barbara Mihalich*

GOLDENBERG HELLER ANTIGNOLI  
& RWOLAND, P.C.  
Mark C. Goldenberg 300990221  
Thomas P. Rosenfeld #06301401  
Kevin P. Green #6299905  
222 South State Route 157

Edwardsville, IL 62025  
T: 618/656-5150  
*Attorneys for Plaintiff Barbara Mihalich*

Dated: September 27, 2017

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP  
Matthew D. Powers

By: s/ Matthew D. Powers  
MATTHEW D. POWERS

Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-3823  
T: 415/984-8700  
F: 415/984-8701

*Attorneys for Defendants Johnson & Johnson;  
and Johnson & Johnson Consumer Inc.*


**[PROPOSED] ORDER**

**THIS MATTER** having come before the Court upon the joint stipulation and request by Plaintiff Barbara Mihalich and Defendants Johnson & Johnson and Johnson & Johnson Consumer Inc., and the Court having considered the stipulation and request and for good cause shown,

IT IS on this 20<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2017, **ORDERED**

1. The *Mihalich* consumer class case, Case No. 3:16-cv-06695-FLW-LHG, is **DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE** on the basis that Plaintiff Mihalich does not allege any injury in fact and lacks standing to bring suit; and
2. The *Mihalich* matter be **CLOSED**.

Dated:

  
The Honorable Freda L. Wolfson  
United States District Judge